

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MOTION SUMMARY
February 26, 2020**

ITEM 1. Roll Call

Chairman Hatten called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

Members Present: Cara Hering, Erinn Nicley, Stephanie VanGundy, Sherry Riviera, Councilwoman Lisa Keller, and Chairman Mark Hatten

Members Absent: Vice-Chairman Joe Coleman

Staff Present: Dianne Guenther, Development Planner

Motion to Excuse: Mr. Nicley motioned to excuse Vice-Chairman Coleman, seconded by Ms. Riviera. Motion approved by a 6-0 vote.

ITEM 2. APPROVAL OF MOTION SUMMARY of the Historic Preservation Commission meeting held on October 22, 2019 as recorded and transcribed.

Motion: Ms. Riveria motioned to approve the Motion Summary of the Historic Preservation Commission meeting held on October 23, 2019, as recorded and transcribed, seconded by Councilwoman Keller. Motion approved by a 4-0-2 (Nicley & VanGundy) vote.

ITEM 3. APPROVAL OF MOTION SUMMARY of the Historic Preservation Commission meeting held on January 22, 2020, as recorded and transcribed.

Motion: Mr. Nicley motioned to approve the Motion Summary of the Historic Preservation Commission meeting held on January 22, 2020, as recorded and transcribed, seconded by Councilwoman Keller. Motion failed with a 3-0-3 (Hering, Nicley, VanGundy) vote.

ITEM 4. REGULAR BUSINESS

A. 2020-0200: A request by Indus Hotels for an amended Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a hotel at 7 and 27 Spring Street which are zoned B-3 (Community Business District) and located in the Transitional Sub-District of the Downtown Historic District Overlay.

Ms. Guenther discussed the location of the property and that the Applicant received a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Commission on September 26, 2019 for the demolition of the existing structures. The Applicant plans are to continue with the demolition of the buildings on the site and construct a new hotel with some modifications to the design of the new building. The proposal continues to be a six-story hotel in the same footprint on the four-parcel

site. The hotel will be a Tru by Hilton Hotel. The current design of the building gives a nod to The Allen Hotel once located at the southwest corner of North Sandusky and East Winter Street.

APPLICANT:

David Kozar
Indus Hotels
1555 Lennox Town Lane
Columbus, Ohio 43212

Brian McNally
Meyers and Associates Architecture
232 North Third Street
Columbus, Ohio

Mr. Kozar discussed changes to the plan to create a more active lobby space to encourage guests to congregate downstairs. Mr. McNally discussed the previous concept based on Hampton Inn and that the brand changed. He discussed the proposed materials including a cast stone limestone base, masonry accents, sills, and bands in pre-cast concrete. The brick accent in the building's center portion is Dark Iron Spot with vertical scores. The off-center entrance allows for a fenced patio and greenspace on the Spring Street elevation. It was discussed that they are currently working with Ohio Wesleyan University on parking and to have an open pedestrian bridge to connect the parking lot to the hotel. They discussed the proposed options presented for the Porte Cochere entryway as well as the northeast building corner façade regarding signage and faux window design detail. They discussed that colors for the signage/branding of the hotel and a mural depicting a faint black and white version of an early colorized historic Delaware post card. They discussed possibly having the community help with plans for a mural design. Mr. McNally discussed their preference for Option A for the Porte Cochere. The Commission recommended their preference to Option B.

The Clerk read into the record public comment received from Commissioner Coleman who was unable to attend the meeting. The statement discussed his concerns regarding a mural and that the Standards do not permit this type of installation and will set a precedent in the district. He also stated he would not be supportive in the material changes regarding the types of bricks used.

Ms. Riviera read the Standards section regarding the guidelines for a new mural and questioned why they can't have a mural. Chairman Hatten discussed that the Standards do not allow for painting on unpainted brick surfaces. Ms. Van Gundy and Councilwoman Keller voiced their

support to a mural on the building. Councilwoman Keller liked the mural presented in the plan. Ms. VanGundy feels that the discussion if a mural is allowed in the Standards should be further discussion. Ms. Hering voiced support to the mural and recommended that the Applicants work with Ohio Wesleyan University.

Mr. Hatten discussed his preference to have the darker brick on the whole building. Ms. Riviera, Councilwoman Keller, and Mr. Nicely voiced their support on the contrasting color.

Chairman Hatten discussed the pedestrian bridge and praised the Applicants for a creative solution. Mr. Nicely voiced support over the bridge and discussed the similarity to the pedestrian bridge at City Hall.

Ms. VanGundy voiced a concern over the bright blue color on the signage and questioned if the logo/branding could be white with the words Tru in blue. Mr. McNally is to look into the Hilton options.

Chairman Hatten discussed his support for the design without the mural. The Applicants discussed receiving approval for the design without the mural and coming back for approval for the mural if needed.

Motion: Mr. Nicely motioned to approve 2020-0200 with staff recommendations 1-7 with the following all proposed signage, included the proposed mural, and condition 8 the proposed Porte Cochere design will be Option B to include the 4 vertical posts, and condition 9 on the northeast corner elevation will choose option A in the proposed application, seconded by Ms. Riviera. This motion was approved by a 6-0 vote.

- B. 2020-0245: A request by Surge Staffing for a Certificate of Appropriateness for proposed storefront renovations at 67 North Sandusky Street, which is zoned B-2 (Central Business District) and located in the Downtown Core of the Downtown Historic District Overlay.

Ms. Hering informed the Commission that she would abstain from the discussion due to previous work on the renovations. Ms. Guenther discussed that the property is a contributing building in the National Register Sandusky Street Historic District and is an 1880's Italianate commercial architecture. She discussed that the Applicant had appeared before the Commission at the January 22, 2020 meeting for an informal review. The Applicant is proposing the following changes:

- a. Remove the existing storefront glass system.
- b. Remove brick planter box.
- c. Remove plywood covering over transom window area and expose and repair prism glass windows if intact or create a matte bronze

- aluminum storefront system if they are not.
- d. Install new matte bronze aluminum storefront system flush with building face.
 - e. Install bronze aluminum sign panel to serve as base trim for transom window area and install black gooseneck lights to illuminate sign area.
 - f. Install cast stone limestone storefront window base on either side central double entry doors to match adjacent building to south.
 - g. On second floor remove existing aluminum windows and replace with six-over-six, arched wood windows to match third floor.
 - h. Paint window sashes and frames in bronze color paint to match bronze aluminum storefront system.

APPLICANT

Mark Lundquist
1100 Morse Road
Columbus, Ohio

Mr. Lundquist discussed taking the suggestions from the Concept Review and adding them into the design. He discussed the suggestion to offset the door to the left. He clarified that the signage will be illuminated by the gooseneck lights.

Chairman Hatten voiced a concern over the increase of doors presented from two to three. Mr. Lundquist discussed moving the doors and moving to a double panel of glass but the spacing of the aluminum looked off balance with one door. Ms. VanGundy discussed the preference to the original plan. Chairman Hatten discussed changing the figuration of the doors. Councilwoman Keller discussed her preference to the original proposal. Chairman Hatten discussed providing a motion to allow the Applicant to pick and choose a design on the door placement. Mr. Lundquist was supportive of this motion.

The Clerk read into the record a statement from Commissioner Coleman regarding his concern over the tinting of windows. Mr. Lundquist did clarify that the windows would not be tinted.

Motion: Mr. Nicley motioned to approve 2020-0245 a Certificate of Appropriateness for 67 North Sandusky for storefront renovations with staff recommendations to include after staff recommendation 1 that the Applicant will submit a final selection for entryway for administrative approval, and all other conditions as proposed, seconded by Ms. VanGundy. Motion approved by a 5-0-1 (Hering) vote.

- C. 2020-0275: A request by KB38 LTD for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed demolition of the rear structure at 40 South Sandusky

Street, which is zoned B-2 (Central Business District) and located in the Downtown Core of the Downtown Historic District Overlay.

Ms. Guenther discussed that the property location is a contributing building in the National Register Sandusky Street Historic District and provided some history on the property. She discussed that the main emphasis of the submission is involving the rear structure of the property as is was constructed on the edge of the Delaware Run. A series of four wood-framed additions were constructed out from the rear of the main brick building in the past and that due to the Delaware Run the wood siding and flooring has begun to rot. Ms. Guenther discussed that due to its deteriorating condition, the entire rear structure is not usable and that the City Chief Building Official has determined the rear structure should be removed.

APPLICANT:

Denny Bolton
KB38 LTD
8005 Wingate Place
Delaware, Ohio

Kreg King
KB38 LTD
5776 Cali Glenn Lane
Westerville, Ohio

Todd Tucky
33 Tarpys Lane
Delaware, Ohio

Ms. Guenther discussed that there will be a separate Certificate of Application for future plans.

Motion: Councilwoman Keller motioned to approve 202-0275, along with staff recommendations, seconded by Ms. Riviera. Motion approved by a 6-0 vote.

- D. 2020-0272: A request by Shade and Shade LLC for an Informal Review for proposed renovation of 39 East William Street and 9 North Union Street, which are zoned B-2 (Central Business District) and located in the Transitional Sub-district of the Downtown Historic District Overlay.

APPLICANTS:

Zach Price
Triad Architects
328 North Liberty Street

Delaware, Ohio 43015

Michael Shade
236 West Central Avenue
Delaware, Ohio 43015

Mr. Price discussed the project consists of two separate buildings. The request is to for demolition of the 39 East William Street building and renovating and redeveloping the building at 9 North Union. He discussed the historical research at the Amanda Plumbing (39 East William Street) building which was a filling station in the current location. The current structure is unknown if historical and the current building is a concrete block building. It does not contain any architectural features of historic significance. Mr. Price discussed the hope to demolish the building and expose more of the south side of the 9 North Union Street and concentrate the efforts on that building. He discussed providing the demolished building area as a parking lot with screening and that the Applicant would like additional parking and potential an entrance on the south side.

Ms. Guenther reviewed the staff report. She discussed staff would be supportive of the demolition of 39 East William Street as it meets the definition of demolition and does not appear to detract from the Historic District. She did inform the Commission that the City does not take lightly the demolition of its structures within the Historic District and given the grade change at the adjoining property line between the two buildings, the project, the site, and community might be better served by retaining the structure as an office building. She reviewed that parking would appear adequate given the existing size of the parcel's parking lot, the public parking lot nearby, and available on-street parking. The renovation rather than demolition is encouraged since the site maintains local history as the long-time home of the Delaware Cab Company, a taxi service established in the community in 1896 with horse-drawn carriages. Should the project move forward, the Applicant will need to continue to work with City Staff to achieve compliance with applicable building and zoning codes regarding the parking area and the use of the building.

Ms. VanGundy questioned if there was any record of the oil station previously being demolished. Mr. Price explained that the two properties are not adjoined and have separate owners. Mr. Price discussed that the current building seems to be more modern concrete materials. Ms. Guenther reviewed the Sanborn Fire Insurance Map dated February 1950.

Ms. Hering questioned which building would be demolished. Mr. Price clarified the goal would be to demolish the current Amanda Plumbing building and allow for the development of 9 North Union Street to move forward. Ms. Guenther discussed that the Auditor's site for Delaware County states that 39 East William Street was built in 1955 and the 9 North Union was built in 1925.

Chairman Hatten voiced concern over demolition as once it is gone and discussed the ability to reuse buildings in interesting ways. He discussed it would help to see a plan of development to the area. Ms. Riviera was in agreement with Chairman Hatten.

Mr. Nicley discussed the Standards to allow for demolition and added what is the cultural significance to the City. He discussed that in his opinion the building has no historic or cultural significance and feels that the building is unattractive and better to remove to allow for future development. Ms. VanGundy voiced her agreement with Mr. Nicley but discussed wanting to see plans for development at 9 North Union Street.

Councilwoman Keller questioned how many additional parking spaces the demolition of the building would provide. Mr. Price answered that it was not formally laid out but expect 5-6 additional spots.

Ms. Riviera discussed not liking that section of the street with the current parking and recommended different uses with landscaping for the area. Mr. Price discussed that the front portion of 39 East William Street is already a current parking area.

Ms. Hering voiced agreement with Chairman Hatten and discussed her recommendation to renovate or rebuild in the area.

Mr. Shade discussed that he is representing a potential user for the site. He discussed the use of the property while growing up in the City. He discussed that the building has not had a property owner willing to spend money to make it happen different than what it is currently there and not add to the historic nature of the downtown. He believes that the building at 9 North Union Street lends a historic nature to the downtown.

Mr. Price discussed that the proposed use of the property will be as a bank or financial institution.

E. DISCUSSIONS

(1) Fiberglass-Clad Windows

Councilwoman Keller requested that this discussion happen at the next meeting regardless if there is a full Commission.

ITEM 5. STAFF COMMENTS

Ms. Guenther informed the Commission that they are working on sidewalk patio permits.

ITEM 6. COMMISSION MEMBER COMMENTS AND DISCUSSION

Mr. Nicley discussed comments received from family regarding the use of vestibules that due to temperatures fluctuations when doors are open they do not like to eat in the downtown during winter.


ITEM 7. NEXT REGULAR MEETING: March 25, 2020

ITEM 8. ADJOURNMENT

Motion: Mr. Nicley moved to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Ms. Riviera. The Historic Preservation Commission meeting adjourned at 8:57 p.m.



Chairperson



Elaine McCloskey, Clerk

Signature on file due to COVID-19 and virtual meeting.